

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE  
TRANSPORT COMMITTEE  
HELD ON FRIDAY, 5 JULY 2019 AT COMMITTEE ROOM A,  
WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50 WELLINGTON STREET, LEEDS**

---

**Present:**

Councillor Kim Groves (Chair)	Leeds City Council
Councillor Martyn Bolt (Leader of the Opposition)	Kirklees Council
Councillor Neil Buckley	Leeds City Council
Councillor Peter Caffrey	Calderdale Council
Councillor Peter Carlill	Leeds City Council
Councillor Michael Ellis	Bradford Council
Councillor Sinead Engel	Bradford Council
Councillor Carmel Hall	Leeds City Council
Councillor James Homewood	Kirklees Council
Councillor Manisha Kaushik (Deputy Chair)	Kirklees Council
Councillor Hassan Khan	Bradford Council
Councillor Taj Salam	Bradford Council
Councillor Daniel Sutherland	Calderdale Council
Councillor Kevin Swift	Wakefield Council

**In attendance:**

Councillor Lisa Mulherin	Leeds City Council
Councillor Alex Ross-Shaw	Bradford Council
Paul Matthews	First Group (from item 8)
Dwayne Wells	Arriva Yorkshire (from item 8)
Khaled Berroum	West Yorkshire Combined Authority (Item 14)
Megan Hemingway	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

**1. Apologies for absence**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor D'Agorne, Councillor Morley, Councillor Box, Mark Roberts and Professor Simon Pringle.

**2. Declarations of disclosable pecuniary interests**

Councillor Salam declared that he is currently employed by First Bus.

### **3. Exempt information - possible exclusion of the press and public**

There were no items requiring exclusion of the press and public.

### **4. Minutes of the meeting of the Transport Committee held on 10 May 2019**

**Resolved:** That the minutes of the Transport Committee held on 10 May 2019 be approved.

### **5. Chairs Brief**

The Chair acknowledged the following new members of Transport Committee:

- Councillor Peter Carlill
- Councillor Andy D'Agorne
- Councillor Sinead Engel
- Councillor Carmel Hall
- Councillor James Homewood
- Councillor Matthew Morley
- Simon Pringle
- Mark Roberts

and extended a welcome to those members present at the meeting.

The Committee was advised that the Combined Authority's Transforming Cities – Future Mobility bid had been successful and was through to the next round on to the short list. This positive news was welcomed.

A number of connectivity visits had taken place to both Nottingham and Birmingham, examining mass transit intelligence. Plans were progressing in terms of transit orientated planning across the city region and a number of meetings had taken place.

It was noted that there was uncertainty around bus operations given the recent announcement of the sales of bus companies. In terms of rail there had been discussions with operators around capacity issues and there had been visits to Leeds Station.

### **6. Governance Arrangements**

The Chair noted the new appointments and meetings for the 2019/20 municipal year and invited comments from the Committee.

The Chairs for the District Consultation Sub-committees were confirmed by the Chair as follows:

- Bradford – Councillor Taj Salam
- Calderdale – Councillor Dan Sutherland
- Kirklees – Councillor James Homewood
- Leeds – Councillor Peter Carlill
- Wakefield – Councillor Kevin Swift

Members questioned the timing, purpose and frequency of meetings. They felt that there should have been more consultation with the DCSC chairs.

The Chair advised the Committee that there are three DCSC meetings per year, as there is also the joint one that takes place in the summer each year. The goal this year is to broaden the role of the Chairs with five planned events taking place to engage local people on local issues. For example- to engage with younger people. Further discussion on the above is on the agenda for the Joint DCSC taking place on Friday 19 July 2019.

Some Chairs had consulted with members of their committees and Bradford reported that 75/80% preferred the 2pm start time. Members were supportive of making the DCSCs more representative, for example consulting large employers in the area whose staff utilise public transport.

The Chair confirmed that she would meet with DCSC Chairs, the Committee's Vice Chair and the Leader of the Opposition to discuss further future plans.

The committee were asked to consider the re-establishment of the Local Bus Working Group and the Cycling and Walking Working Group. Members asked why the Rail Operators Forum was not listed and why the Committee had not been asked to re-approve the Zero Emission Working Group.

They were informed that the meeting with train operators was a forum not a working group, and that because the Zero Emission Working Group had only just been approved as a new group there was no need to re-approve. Alan Reiss confirmed that he was happy to circulate the Terms of Reference of the new group to members.

The Committee noted that a climate change emergency had been declared last week.

**Resolved:**

- (i) That the terms of reference for Transport Committee, attached as appendix to the submitted report be noted.
- (ii) That the following appointments made by the Combined Authority be noted:
  - Councillor Kim Groves as Chair of Transport Committee
  - Councillor Manisha Kaushik as Deputy Chair of Transport Committee
  - Councillor Martyn Bolt as leader of the opposition on Transport Committee
- (iii) That a District Consultation Sub-Committee for the 2019/20 municipal year be established for each constituent council area, with terms of reference as set out in the submitted report.
- (iv) That each Transport Committee member co-opted from a

constituent council as a voting member.

- (v) That the appointment of Chairs of each for District Consultation Sub-Committee be made as follows:
  - (a) Councillor Taj Salam – Chair of Bradford District Consultation Sub-Committee
  - (b) Councillor Dan Sutherland – Chair of Calderdale District Consultation Sub-Committee
  - (c) Councillor Manisha Kaushik – Chair of Kirklees District Consultation Sub-Committee
  - (d) Councillor James Homewood- Chair of Leeds District Consultation Sub-Committee
  - (e) Councillor Kevin Swift – Chair of Wakefield District Consultation Sub-Committee
- (vi) That the calendar of meeting dates for each District Consultation Sub-Committee, as set out in the submitted report, be approved.
- (vii) That the Local Bus Services Working Group be re-established for the municipal year 2019/20, with the terms of reference and arrangements as set out in the submitted report.
- (viii) That the Cycling and Walking Working Group be re-established for the municipal year 2019/20, with the terms of reference and arrangements as set out in the submitted report.

## **7. School Bus Guidelines**

The Committee were presented with the revised School Bus Guidelines, the purpose of which was to enable young people to get to school and to focus spending where needed. Consultation had taken place as detailed in the report and revised guidelines produced on the back of this.

It was confirmed that there would be no sudden impact on services in September 2019 and any changes would be phased in.

Members noted that over half the consultation responses came from the Calderdale area due to having two selective schools in the area. They were reassured that discussions were taking place with Calderdale officers regards a self-financing offering which would be more efficient to meet demand.

The Committee commented that there was no Special Educational Needs (SEN) transport provision mentioned. It was confirmed that under the Transport Act the provision of SEN transport lies with each District Council, although the Combined Authority can assist with arrangements.

Within the report it stated that the Combined Authority will ensure routes are safe in order that pupils may cycle to school. Members asked whether the Combined Authority also ensure children have undertaken the bike-ability course and that there is provision of cycle storage at school. They also asked if there was any way to discourage car-use by parents.

The Chair confirmed that the Combined Authority is working with partner councils and schools to encourage walking and cycling to school and that there was a need to have a more transit orientated plan – such as the exemplar of Waltham Forest. A presentation was planned on this for a future meeting.

It was noted that a climate emergency had been declared last week at the Combined Authority's annual meeting on 27 June. Members felt that it was taking too long to see any output and suggested it would be useful to have a discussion at the next meeting.

**Resolved:**

- (i) That the Transport Committee approved the adoption of the revised School Bus Guidelines.
- (ii) That the implementation of the revised School Bus Guidelines be carried out as described in the report.

**8. West Yorkshire Bus Alliance**

The Committee considered a report which took the commitments from the Bus Alliance partnership and presented a proposed Delivery Plan. It was noted that the April 2019 Combined Authority meeting had approved this approach.

The Chair invited Dwayne Wells from Arriva and Paul Matthews from First to sit at the table to provide further information on the potential sales / restructuring of their respective companies. Members wanted to safeguard services and to drive up bus usage via the Bus Alliance but were concerned as to the impact of a change in ownership. Concern was also raised as to the ownership of new buses in the advent of a take-over.

First Bus confirmed that they were in the early stages of separating out the bus operation which could lead to a sale but there was no confirmation as yet. It was appreciated that this could lead to uncertainty amongst the Combined Authority, customers and staff.

The commitment to low emissions had already been made and would be honoured as a sale would take a number of years to complete. It was confirmed that the First Group PLC Chief Executive was meeting Councillor Groves and Councillor Blake shortly to address concerns.

Members commented that to increase bus patronage by the 25% target, groups needed to be engaged, specifically women and the use of social media. The operators acknowledged that this was a challenge and that the top concern for women was safety, hence the promotion of CCTV on vehicles. They welcomed any further suggestions.

The Chair noted that although bus usage figures were declining, the region is still strong in comparison with other areas of the country despite a £1 million per annum reduction in the Transport Levy available to help fund bus

provision.

Both operators present agreed that the growth target was achievable but there are still reliability issues. The Bus Alliance would strengthen this. However, Arriva informed members that due to congestion issues they had to add extra vehicles into the fleet this year and that with further infrastructure investment they would be able to re-deploy these extra vehicles.

The Combined Authority confirmed that they had launched a Bus Information Strategy consultation this week, with the primary focus on pricing, product and promotion.

Members discussed the following issues and areas of concern:

- The lack of services from Mirfield to Leeds – every 2 hours
- The need for regular services
- The requirement to serve rural communities, colleges and an ageing population (social isolation)
- The public want reliable and affordable services
- The success of the Young Persons M-Card
- Congestion needs to be addressed in Leeds City centre
- Areas around arterial routes need investment
- The option of mini-bus operators, perhaps on a demand response
- Arriva 'Click' service – demand responsive being tested in Leicester and Liverpool
- The impact of Uber on increasing congestion
- Need better public transport to support the clean air zones
- Access to employment is key

**Resolved:**

- (i) That the establishment of the West Yorkshire Bus Alliance as a voluntary partnership and the signature of the Voluntary Partnership Agreement by the Chair of Transport Committee be endorsed.
- (ii) That the West Yorkshire Bus Alliance Delivery Plans, as set out in the submitted report, be endorsed.

**9. Presentation of Core Bus Network for Customers**

Members were invited to look at examples posted around the room on ways of making the core bus network easier to use. These included a key routes map, coloured depending on key code and a new bus stop flag which was also colour coded. It was noted that First Bradford already had key coloured routes so any new concept would have to take this into account.

There was still a concern regards the reduction of the frequency of services and how this would affect publicised routes. It was confirmed that the main core network, as in the coloured routes, would be consistent services so not subject to change. The idea was at a concept stage at present, Members and customers' feedback will be helpful in refining the proposals.

**Resolved:** That the Transport Committee noted and advised on the work to date to provide a simplified presentation of the core bus network.

## 10. Transport Services Budget Update

The Committee was provided with a budget update. Key points to note were:

- There was a target to reduce expenditure on bus services to £15.8 million by 2021 which was on track at present. The Local Bus Working Group would be looking at this and bringing back to the committee later in the year
- A review of the discretionary Concessionary Travel budget
- Steps to reduce the cost to the taxpayer of administering the MCard and providing travel information are under consideration
- Targets were being set to increase revenue from external sources supported by a new asset management plan

Members were concerned that charging for toilet use at stations was affecting vulnerable groups and that not everyone carries cash. However, it was confirmed that the charging for toilet use was not purely revenue driven but was increasing patronage, due to reducing anti-social behaviour.

**Resolved:**

- (i) That the current progress towards meeting the 2019/20 revenue budget and medium term financial strategy as set out in the submitted report be noted.
- (ii) That the Local Bus Working Group be convened to review options to amend the Committee's policy guidelines in respect of supported bus services prior to the Committee's consideration of such revisions later in 2019.

## 11. Local Industrial Strategy

The Committee was given the background to the establishment of the Local Industrial Strategy (LIS) and how the Combined Authority was working closely with Government to draft a LIS for the Leeds City Region. Members were referred to paragraph 2.7 of the report where examples were given of regions who already had a draft LIS.

Key issues to developing a successful LIS were as follows:

- To understand what makes the region distinctive
- Explore regional links to national problems
- Future mobility
- Improving productivity – output per worker is lower than national average
- Inclusive Growth
- Carbon reduction and climate change

- Business to business interaction
- Skillsets meeting industry needs

Members were informed this was a first conversation. It was noted that the two regions who already had a draft LIS had identified the same examples as Leeds City Region would choose as also making their region distinctive, namely Health, Creative & Digital and Culture.

Suggestions were made of perhaps developing freight opportunities, promoting the region as a manufacturing leader and exploring the cross-over opportunities of different industries which could be innovative.

It was noted that in terms of being a leader in the arts the region was currently producing more than London and the North West or Midlands according to the Arts Council.

Members stressed the importance of ensuring that no specific areas of the region got left behind, geographically or otherwise, and that training and education were key to ensure no group was excluded in order productivity and inclusive growth goals were achieved. Transport being the key enabler.

The Chair agreed to arrange a presentation from the Hull Ports which were visited last week, in relation to freight opportunities.

**Resolved:**

- (i) That the progress made in developing a Local Industrial Strategy (LIS) for the Leeds City Region be noted.
- (ii) That feedback provided by the Committee, particularly in relation to transport and productivity growth be taken on board.

## **12. Leeds City Region Transport Update**

The Committee considered a report which gave an update on Leeds City Region Transport matters.

Members queried why new stations are built with insufficient trains stopping at them; for example Appley Bridge and Kirkstall Forge. It was appreciated that there are timetable issues but comment was made this could be better planned.

The Combined Authority agreed that planning in general needs to be better although it has improved. It was reported that trains are running as best they could at the moment. Improvements planned for December 2019 had been delayed by Manchester and Leeds issues.

It was noted from the report that the Calder Valley line was still under-performing due to the short forming of trains. Members asked whether Northern could confirm when new rolling stock would be delivered.

It was confirmed that new trains are now operating between Leeds to



Doncaster and that some Pacer trains will be used into next year as new rolling stock was taking longer than anticipated to be deployed. It was noted that Northern was not at the meeting due to staffing but that both the Chair and the Combined Authority had raised these concerns with them. Northern would be encouraged to attend the next Transport Committee. Members voiced extreme disappointment that the Pacers continued to be operational.

Members asked for an update from operators to be given at the next Transport Committee on plans to improve services. Concerns were raised again about over-optimistic updates provided by operators on deployment of new rolling stock for November/ December 2019.

The Chair confirmed that Councillor Blake was attending a future meeting to talk about the Blake-Jones Review, which was anticipated to have been signed off by then.

Members reiterated their support of HS2 and the suggestions of the Williams review and were hopeful that the new Prime Minister would share this view.

**Resolved:**

- (i) That the updates provided in the report be noted.
- (ii) That the amendments to the Bus Hotspots and Smartcard and Information Programmes, as detailed in the submitted report, be approved.

**13. Local Cycling and Walking Infrastructure Plans**

The Committee were provided with an update on the progress made developing the Local Cycling and Walking Infrastructure Plans. Stakeholder engagement had also begun on the plans with each partner council.

Questions and comments were invited from the Committee.

Members were concerned about the large amount of debris being found on the Shipley to Bradford cycle way and commented that large stones and glass were causing punctures and could deter users. This issue had also been raised at Leeds Council meetings along with the safety and lighting of the cycle paths. Members felt that maintenance of the paths needed to be more fully considered within the project delivery.

Councillor Buckley asked for an update on the Super Cycle Highway. The Chair promised Councillor Buckley an update.

**Resolved:** That the progress made on the development of the Local Cycling and Walking Infrastructure Plans, and the commencement of stakeholder engagement on the draft plans produced for each partner council, be noted.

**14. Scrutiny Annual Report 2018- 19 and Statutory Guidance**

The Committee considered a report summarising the work undertaken by the

Overview and Scrutiny Committee in 2018/19.

Members agreed that the scrutiny function was important and felt that only one scrutiny committee for the whole organisation was a concern regards being potentially overworked.

The Chair agreed that certainly in the event of devolution the function of scrutiny would be re-examined.

**Resolved:**

- (i) That the annual report summarising the work undertaken by the Overview and Scrutiny Committee in 2018/19, appended to the submitted report be noted.
- (ii) That the new statutory guidance issued by the government and next steps be noted.

**15. Summary of Transport Schemes**

The Committee considered a report which provided an update on the transport related schemes considered by the West Yorkshire and York Investment Committee.

Members noted the various projects.

Paragraph 2.9 of the submitted report on the small East Bradford link road scheme makes reference to the scheme as going through Holmewood. Members commented that they had been led to believe this road would eventually go to Leeds Bradford Airport via greenbelt land, transparency in this was questioned. It was confirmed that the SE Bradford link road near Holmewood was a defined scheme for the Transport Fund which did not include plans for any further expansion.

With reference to paragraph 2.7 of the submitted report, members questioned how the large schemes link to one another. It was reported that work was often taking place neighbouring one another and there needed to be planning to ensure bus lanes worked effectively and the provision of bus services and direct services to Leeds along the newly created corridors.

The Chair agreed that there should be more work done in relation to this with Portfolio holders, especially as it was Local Authority funding.

Members raised the ongoing issue of parking at Shipley and Frizinghall rail stations and the Chair agreed to feedback on this between meetings.

It was agreed that a joint meeting with the Investment Committee would be useful for members to be updated on schemes (as had happened previously). The Chair agreed that this would be arranged.

**Resolved:** The Committee noted the report.